Do Wind Projects Adversely Affect Proximate Residential Property Values?

The most basic law of economics is that things are valued based on the "Law of Supply and Demand." It is exceedingly obvious, all things being equal, that many people (due to view, sound, flicker, etc) would choose NOT to buy a home where there are industrial wind turbines close by. (Whether they are right or wrong in their reasons is irrelevant.)

These beliefs would **reduce demand,** which clearly would have **some** negative impact on the price of such a property. Any report that concludes that there are zero negative property value effects related to wind projects simply can not be considered seriously. The only real question is *how much of an impact?*

This list is intended to identify just some of the more objective studies and commentary about the adverse effects of wind energy projects on home values near wind projects.

1 - Here are some more detailed analyses about wind project effects on property values, by independent professionals:

A 2013 <u>Study</u> of over a million homes by the *London School of Economics*, concluded that properties near turbines will decline in value.

Searchlight wind farm could reduce property values by 25-60 percent, suggest studies.

A 2012 study by Lansink Appraisers: Diminution in Price.

A 2012 Study by E.ON Energy Research Center (German Utility company): <u>The Impact of Wind Farms on Property Values</u>.

2012 testimony in Lee County, Illinois, by appraiser Michael McCann.

A 2011 study <u>Values in the Wind: A Hedonic Analysis of Wind Power</u> <u>Facilities</u> by Clarkson economics professor, Dr. Martin Heintzelman.

A 2011 <u>Study</u> by appraiser Michael McCann on property value impacts in Cape Vincent, New York.

A 2011 Report by appraiser Michael McCann on property value impacts in Brewster, Massachusetts.

<u>Testimony</u> of appraiser Michael McCann on property value impacts in Adams County, Illinois.

A <u>study</u> done by Metropolitan Appraisal, regarding the Forward Wind Project (Wisconsin).

"A <u>Wind Turbine Impact Study</u>" by appraisers: Appraisal Group One, and a later version.

A valuable <u>report</u>: "Impact of Wind Turbines on Market Value of Texas Rural Land" by Gardner Appraisal Group.

"Living with the impact of windmills" <u>presentation</u> by Real Estate broker Chris Luxemburger, is an analysis of some 600 sales over a three year period.

<u>Testimony</u> of Maturen & Associates, Real Estate Appraisers, concerning the effects of wind projects on home values.

In addition to being an excellent noise an health effects report, this document has a twenty page appendix on property values.

Wind Power Siting Issues: <u>Overview</u>" (by energy expert Tom Hewson): cites several studies.

Appraisers report property value <u>losses</u> near turbines.

Government Agency <u>agrees</u> that turbines do devalue property!

Property assessments <u>reduced</u> near turbines.

Property assessment <u>lowered</u> for home near wind project.

Grafton Vermont Property Values Forum (1/17/14): Mike McCann

Council tax cut for homes near wind farms.

2 - These are some other analyses and commentary about wind project effects on property values:

Wind farm 'blight' cutting value of homes by up to a third.

"How do wind turbines affect property value?"

<u>Property values are the new front line in the war over wind turbines</u> 32 Lawsuits against wind developer — including property value loss

Falmouth Real Estate - "The Turbine Effect"

<u>Turbines complicate sales of abutting homes.</u>

"Wind Industry Big Lie: Your Property Value Will Not Be Affected.".

Vermont Wind Developer buys neighboring property after lawsuit

"A new slant on wind projects" offers a very helpful <u>idea</u> as to put some of the economic benefits of wind projects into perspective.

This <u>site</u> has a fine collection of property value articles.

"Property Values decrease by 40% if view of wind turbines" is an <u>analysis</u> of a real estate broker on turbine impacts on residential values.

An excellent <u>discussion</u> by the Wisconsin Realtor Association about the adverse effects of wind development.

An <u>analysis</u> by an Illinois Realtor about effects of wind projects.

A <u>survey</u> by a Wyoming Realtor concluded that properties nearby a wind project were virtually unmarketable.

"Property values blowing in the wind" is a <u>report</u> done by a local Realtor about wind project effects in her area of northern NY.

See <u>here</u> and <u>here</u> where two Realtors make formal testimony about the effects of wind turbines on property values.

Landowners say Turbines have Hurt their Property Values.

Wind turbines have reduced property values, court says.

Wind Turbine Compensation Stirring Discontent (Denmark).

"How Industrial Wind Projects Affect Property Values" is a worthwhile <u>commentary</u> by Chuck Ebbing.

A nice <u>presentation</u> "Turbine Effects on View Shed" by engineer Chuck Ebbing.

"Impact of wind farms on the value of residential property and agricultural land" an RICS (Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors) Survey.

"Farm couple fights wind turbines".

A newspaper article: "Critics say wind turbines hurt land values."

"Wind turbine homes threat" is a news report.

"I predict a series of rural ghettos of abandoned, unmaintained homes" <u>says</u> an experienced appraiser.

The <u>Better Plan</u> website has a good example of a real estate problem, plus some good recommendations.

Here is a good news story about homeowners holding out for the wind developers to buy their property — and succeeding <u>very well</u>.

This <u>article</u> says: "Horizon, opponents debate effects on property".

"U.S. wrestling with property values and setbacks for its wind turbines" touches on several related matters.

This UK site site lists several other sources regarding property values.

"Giant blades are slicing home prices" an <u>article</u> about experiences in England.

"An Ill Wind Blowing" is a <u>story</u> about an English family's experiences with a wind project depreciating their home value.

Ontario Parliament member calls for a provincial home value <u>study</u> about another English family's experiences with a wind project depreciating their home value.

"Windfarm Blows House Value Away" is a <u>story</u> about another English family's experiences with a wind project depreciating their home value.

"Wind farm property sells at sheriff's sale."

3 - This is specifically directed at landowners who are considering signing a wind lease:

"Know The Facts BEFORE You Sign" by the Informed Farmers Coalition.

4 - Here are some sample Property Value Guarantee agreements:

Note that despite the wind energy proponent's continued claims that their projects have no adverse effects on property values, Iberdrola officially told this NNY community that they would not construct a project there if they were required to compensate land owners for property value losses. Most people would see that as being very hypocritical.

In my view this brings up a KEY point. Wind developers often get approval based on specious claims (regarding jobs created, CO2 saved, etc.). They get away with this as there is no real penalty for exaggerations or stretching the truth. One of the best ways to counter this is to require that **all** these claims be legally guaranteed, in writing. Just like what happened in the above case, you will see an immediate back-tracking. This will reveal to citizens the accuracy and sincerity of the developer's assertions.

The Carteret County (NC) <u>Tall Structure Ordinance</u> includes an excellent property value guarantee. This was passed in February of 2014.

The Town of Newport (NC) also has a similar property value guarantee that was included in their wind law (Article IX), in late 2013.

This basic real <u>Property Value Guarantee</u> agreement was based on a plan drafted by Illinois lawyers.

DeKalb County (Illinois) Property Value Guarantee <u>Agreement</u>. Some good <u>commentary</u> on the DeKalb Property Value Guarantee.

Property Value Guarantee Agreement from Adams County, Illinois.

An explanation of the fine Property Value <u>Agreement</u> created in Hammond, NY, and a later <u>version</u>. [Wind developer for Hammond says <u>they will leave</u> if there is a Property Value Guarantee.]

Montville Maine Wind Ordinance includes a Property Value Guarantee.

New Hampshire Town passes 3 mile Property Value Guarantee (2014)

A Property Value Guarantee proposed for the entire state of Maine.

In March 2014, the New Hampshire Senate passed a bill (SB281) requiring: "The use of best available mitigation measures to avoid or minimize aesthetic, ecological, health, and property value impacts as a condition for a certificate, and the establishment of a methodology to evaluate and mitigate negative impacts on property values."

"Wind turbines constitute a 'taking' of private property value."

<u>Sumner Maine PVG</u> — note they propose a condition that the developer must enter into separate agreements with proximate property owners.

<u>This</u> is the "Fenner, NY: Canastota Wind Power LLC: Property Value Assurance Plan".

This is Denmark's federal wind energy law, which (among other things) says:

"An erector of a wind turbine has a duty to pay compensation for loss of value."

Proposed Property Value Guarantee for Riga, Michigan (2011).

Proposed Property Value Guarantee for Town of Knox, NY (2013).

"Developers seek elimination of property value guarantee" (2013) and "BZA limits property value guarantee testimony" (same project).

A town meeting <u>video</u> where a wind developer (and his ally) is quizzed about providing a Property Value Guarantee. Note they refuse to offer one.

5 - These are some critiques of the Hoen/Wiser report:

Debunking of Hoen's latest turbine property value missive (8/13).

"Wind Farms, Residential Property Values and Rubber Rulers" - is commentary by appraiser Albert Wilson.

"Critique of The Impact of Wind Power Projects on Residential Property Values in the US: A Multi-Site Hedonic Analysis" by Wayne Gulden.

"DOE study says wind farms don't affect property values, but..." is a <u>report</u> by The Acoustical Ecology Institute.

A detailed <u>critique 1</u> by appraiser Mike McCann, and a second one about a later Hoen report <u>critique 2</u>.

"Turbine Effects on View Shed" are <u>observations</u> by engineer Chuck Ebbing (starts on page 20).

"False conclusions based on flawed real estate studies" are some fine commentaries <u>here</u>, <u>here</u>, and <u>here</u> by WindAction.

A good <u>critique</u> of two earlier studies (similar to Hoen/Wiser) by Michael J. Miller, FCAS, MAAA.

The Proposed Prairie Breeze Wind Project Will Harm the Property Values of Non-participating Owners.

6 - Some Other Options:

In my view we should be piggybacking on ideas currently being employed by environmental groups to stop hydrofracking. Here is an example: <u>Sue Your Neighbor</u>. Make sure to look at the part about an "anticipatory nuisance." *Constructive condemnation* is another possibility, but appears to be a subset of the "anticipatory nuisance" legal definition.

Here is a relevant <u>case</u> where a Canadian homeowner sued to have his property assessment lowered due to nearby noise from a power station. He won the lawsuit and received a significant reduction.

If you know of other good material, or there are errors of omission or commission here, please email these to John at: "aaprjohn at northnet dot org".

Rev 11/29/14